



ISSN:2338-2554

E-ISSN: 2809-0691

WIDYA PUBLIKA

JURNAL ILMIAH MAGISTER ADMINISTRASI PUBLIK
PASCASARJANA UNIVERSITAS NGURAH RAI

EVALUATION OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE POLICY ON RESTRICTING SINGLE-USE PLASTIC WASTE IN BALI PROVINCE FROM A COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE PERSPECTIVE

I Gusti Ayu Agung Desi Pratiwi¹, Desak Made Trisna Juliantari Dewi²

¹Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Ngurah Rai University, Email :

gung07.desipratiwi@gmail.com

²Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Ngurah Rai University, Email:

madetrisnajuliantari@unr.ac.id

Abstract

Plastic waste has become one of the most critical environmental challenges affecting sustainable development in Bali Province as an international tourism destination. The Provincial Government of Bali enacted Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning the Restriction of Single-Use Plastic Waste to reduce the consumption of plastic bags, plastic straws, and styrofoam. Although the implementation of this policy has demonstrated significant progress, several challenges remain, including inconsistent compliance among business actors, limited enforcement, and insufficient collaboration among stakeholders. This study aims to evaluate the implementation of Bali's single-use plastic restriction policy using the Collaborative Governance perspective. A qualitative policy research approach was employed through document analysis, observation, and in-depth interviews involving government agencies, business actors, environmental organizations, customary villages, and local communities. Data were analyzed using the Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña interactive model. The findings indicate that policy implementation has been supported by government commitment, community participation, private sector engagement, and the active role of customary villages. However, inter-

agency coordination, monitoring mechanisms, and stakeholder collaboration require further improvement. Strengthening a Collaborative Governance model based on local institutions is recommended to enhance sustainable environmental governance in Bali.

Keywords: *Collaborative Governance, Policy Evaluation, Single-Use Plastic, Policy Implementation, Bali.*

A. INTRODUCTION

The implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste is one of the environmental policy innovations that shows the commitment of the Bali Provincial Government to reduce plastic pollution while strengthening environmentally based sustainable development. The regulation regulates the use of plastic bags, plastic straws, and polystyrene (styrofoam) in government agencies, business actors, educational institutions, shopping centers, hotels, restaurants, and the community. The policy is not only directed at reducing the volume of plastic waste, but also aims to build changes in people's consumption behavior through preventive, educational, and collaborative approaches. This orientation reflects the paradigm shift in environmental management from an end-of-pipe approach to waste reduction from source to source, which is currently a best practice in waste management policies in various countries.

The implementation of Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 has experienced significant developments over the past few years. The Bali Provincial Government continues to strengthen the implementation of these regulations through the issuance of Circular Letter Number 2 of 2025 concerning the Implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018. The circular requires all regional apparatus, regional-owned enterprises, and schools within the Bali Provincial Government not to provide drinking water in plastic packaging or food that uses single-use plastic packaging in office activities and ceremonial events. State civil servants are also required to bring tumblers as part of the formation of an environmentally friendly work culture. The policy shows that the implementation of regulations does not stop at the normative

stage, but continues to be strengthened through administrative instruments to improve the compliance of government organizations with policy objectives.

Strengthening policy implementation is also shown through coordination across regional apparatus and customary institutions. The Bali Provincial Indigenous Peoples Development Office together with the Customary Village Assembly periodically hold coordination meetings to strengthen the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 and Bali Governor's Regulation Number 47 of 2019 concerning Source-Based Waste Management. The involvement of the Customary Village Assembly shows that the Bali Provincial Government integrates formal institutions with local institutions in supporting the successful implementation of environmental policies. This integration is a characteristic that distinguishes the implementation of environmental policies in Bali from other regions in Indonesia because it utilizes social capital, customary norms, and community-based supervision mechanisms.

The success of public policy implementation is not only determined by the quality of regulations, but also influenced by institutional capacity, inter-agency coordination, availability of resources, policy communication, and the level of compliance of target groups. The perspective of policy implementation developed by Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) explains that the success of implementation is influenced by six main variables, namely policy standards and objectives, resources, characteristics of implementing organizations, interorganizational communication, socio-economic and political conditions, and implementing disposition. The framework is relevant to evaluate the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 because plastic restriction policies involve government organizations, the private sector, communities, and customary institutions that have different characteristics, interests, and capacities in implementing policies.

The complexity of plastic waste management causes conventional bureaucratic approaches to solve environmental problems no longer adequate. The characteristics of environmental problems are cross-sectoral, cross-regional, and involve many actors, so they require governance that is able to integrate various interests collaboratively. The Collaborative Governance approach develops as one of the public administration paradigms that places the government not as the only actor to solve public problems, but as a facilitator who builds collaboration with the private

sector, civil society organizations, academics, the media, and the community in producing more effective, participatory, and sustainable policies.

Ansell and Gash (2008) define Collaborative Governance as a collective decision-making process involving government and non-government actors through a consensus-oriented formal forum. Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh (2012) developed the concept by emphasizing the importance of collaboration dynamics built through principled engagement, shared motivation, and capacity for joint action. This perspective provides an explanation that the successful implementation of environmental policies depends not only on compliance with regulations, but also on the quality of relationships between stakeholders, levels of trust, shared commitment, exchange of resources, and coordination mechanisms that take place on a sustainable basis.

The context of the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 shows that local governments have a role as regulators, coordinators, and facilitators in building collaboration. Business actors play a role in transforming the use of environmentally friendly packaging, civil society organizations carry out public education, academics provide evidence-based recommendations, the media increases public awareness, while customary villages strengthen compliance through social norms and *awig-awig*. The relationship between these actors forms a network of interdependent governance so that the effectiveness of policy implementation is largely determined by the quality of coordination and collective commitment of all stakeholders.

The role of indigenous villages is a very important dimension in the implementation of environmental policies in Bali. Customary villages have strong social legitimacy because they are able to regulate community behavior through cultural values, *awig-awig*, and social sanction mechanisms accepted by the community. Strengthening the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 through coordination with the Customary Village Assembly shows that local governments utilize local institutions as an instrument to strengthen community compliance with environmental policies. The approach reflects the practice of Collaborative Governance that integrates formal government institutions with local culture-based social institutions.

Studies on the implementation of plastic waste restriction policies in Bali have developed in recent years. Wira Adnyana and Dharma Laksana (2022) found that the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 in Sibang Kaja Village was influenced by policy communication, village government support, and community participation. The research shows that changing people's behavior requires a continuous education process and local institutional support so that policies can be widely accepted.

Research by Surya Wibisana (2023) regarding the implementation of policies to limit single-use plastic waste in Gianyar Regency shows that the effectiveness of the policy still faces obstacles in the form of limited supervision, low compliance of some business actors, and the uneven use of alternatives to single-use plastics. The findings indicate that successful implementation is not only determined by the existence of regulations, but also requires stronger cross-sector coordination.

The latest research conducted by Adnyana (2025) shows that the implementation of Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 within the Bali Provincial Government has not been fully optimal. Obstacles to implementation are still found in the low habit of some employees carrying tumblers, limitations in the provision of alternative non-plastic drinking water, and the still dominant use of plastic packaging in some government activities. The results of the study show that the challenges of policy implementation do not only occur in the community and the private sector, but also in government organizations as the main implementers of policies.

A review of previous research shows that most studies are still oriented towards implementation analysis using the Edward III, Van Meter and Van Horn models, as well as conventional policy implementation approaches. Studies on the quality of relationships between stakeholders, collaboration dynamics, trust building, collaborative leadership, resource sharing, and institutional capacity in the implementation of Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 are still relatively limited. This gap shows that the collaborative governance dimension has not received adequate attention in explaining the success and obstacles to the implementation of plastic waste restriction policies in Bali Province.

B. METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with an evaluative case study design to analyze the implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste in Bali Province. The qualitative approach was chosen because it was able to provide a comprehensive understanding of the dynamics of policy implementation, relationships between actors, collaboration processes, and various factors that affect the success and obstacles to policy implementation. The focus of the research is not only directed at implementation achievements, but also at the process of interaction between stakeholders in the perspective of Collaborative Governance.

The research paradigm used is constructivism, which views policy implementation as a social process formed through interaction, negotiation, and collaboration between the government, the private sector, society, non-governmental organizations, academics, the media, and local institutions. This paradigm allows researchers to understand the meaning, perception, and experience of each actor in implementing single-use plastic waste restriction policies so that they can produce a more in-depth evaluation compared to an approach that only measures the level of success quantitatively.

The research location is in the Province of Bali with a focus on regional apparatus organizations that have the authority to implement policies to limit single-use plastic waste, such as the Bali Provincial Forestry and Environment Service, the Bali Province Indigenous Peoples Promotion Office, district/city governments, Customary Village Assemblies, customary villages, business actors (hotels, restaurants, shopping centers, and micro businesses), civil society organizations engaged in the environment, and community members. The selection of the location was carried out purposively because Bali Province is the first region in Indonesia to implement a comprehensive policy to limit single-use plastics through Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018.

Data analysis uses the Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2014) Interactive Model which includes four stages, namely data collection, data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. The condensation stage is carried out by grouping data based on research themes, namely policy communication, coordination between stakeholders, community

participation, institutional capacity, collaborative leadership, and implementation effectiveness. The data presentation stage is carried out through analytical narratives, matrices, and maps of relationships between actors to facilitate the interpretation process. The final stage is carried out by drawing conclusions based on patterns, causal relationships, and findings obtained during the research.

The evaluation of policy implementation was carried out using the perspective of Collaborative Governance developed by Ansell and Gash (2008) and Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh (2012). The analysis is focused on several main dimensions, namely starting conditions, institutional design, facilitative leadership, collaborative process, shared motivation, capacity for joint action, and collaborative outcomes. The use of this framework allows the research to evaluate policy implementation not only from the aspect of regulatory compliance, but also from the quality of relationships, coordination, and synergy between stakeholders in achieving policy objectives.

C. EXPLANATION

Implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste

The implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 shows the commitment of the Bali Provincial Government in integrating environmental policies with the sustainable tourism development agenda. The regulation was born in response to the increase in plastic waste generation which has an impact on environmental quality, public health, and the competitiveness of the tourism sector. Bali's characteristics as an international tourist destination cause an increase in economic activities, trade, services, and public consumption with direct implications for the increase in the volume of single-use plastic waste. This condition places the reduction of single-use plastics as one of the regional policy priorities in supporting low-carbon development and the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals.

Data from the National Waste Management Information System (SIPSN) of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry shows that Bali Province produces more than 680 thousand tons of waste per year, with the composition of plastic waste ranging from 12–15% of the total waste

generation. This percentage shows that plastic is one of the largest types of waste after organic waste. The characteristics of plastic that are difficult to decompose cause pollution accumulation to occur in urban areas, rivers, final processing sites, and coastal areas that are the center of tourism activities. This phenomenon strengthens the urgency of implementing the policy of restricting single-use plastics as an instrument to control environmental pollution while maintaining the sustainability of Bali's tourism industry.

The main substance of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 focuses on restricting the use of three types of single-use plastic products, namely plastic bags, plastic straws, and polystyrene (styrofoam). The scope of implementation includes government agencies, regionally owned enterprises, hotels, restaurants, shopping centers, modern markets, educational institutions, and the community as end users. This approach shows that the government not only regulates producers and business actors, but also seeks to change people's consumption behavior through the formation of a culture of using environmentally friendly products.

The implementation of the policy shows a change in behavior in the formal business sector. The observation results show that most of the star hotels, modern shopping malls, restaurants, and cafes in the Denpasar, Badung, Gianyar, and Bangli areas have replaced plastic bags with paper bags, reusable bags, and biodegradable packaging. The use of plastic straws has also decreased significantly because it has been replaced by bamboo straws, metal straws, paper straws, and straws made of natural fibers. This transformation shows the compliance of business actors with government policies as well as increasing consumer awareness of the importance of using environmentally friendly products.

Policy implementation is strengthened through the issuance of the Bali Governor's Circular Letter Number 2 of 2025 which regulates the implementation of Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 within the Bali Provincial Government. The policy requires all regional apparatus to eliminate the use of drinking water in plastic packaging in every government activity and replace it with dispensers and drinking containers that can be used repeatedly. State Civil Apparatus is also required to carry tumblers as part of the organizational culture that supports

plastic waste reduction. This step shows that the government is trying to build bureaucratic precedent as an instrument for changing people's behavior.

The results of interviews with officials of the Bali Provincial Forestry and Environment Service show that the implementation of the policy has experienced positive developments after intensive socialization to business actors and the community. Most modern shopping malls have stopped giving away plastic bags for free. Hoteliers have also begun to integrate the principle of green hotels through reducing the use of single-use plastics in room facilities, restaurants, and operational activities. The change shows that a persuasive and educational approach has an influence on the level of compliance of business actors compared to an approach that is only oriented towards the enforcement of administrative sanctions.

Policy implementation has not shown an even level of success across sectors. The results of the study found that micro business actors, traditional market traders, and small-scale food businesses still use plastic bags and packaging made of single-use plastic because they consider aspects of production costs, the availability of packaging alternatives, and consumer preferences. The relatively higher price of environmentally friendly packaging compared to conventional plastic is one of the factors that hinders the transformation of packaging use in micro business groups. This condition shows that the effectiveness of policy implementation is influenced by the economic ability of business actors to adapt to regulatory changes.

The level of community compliance also shows variations based on regional characteristics and environmental education levels. Urban communities tend to be more receptive to the use of reusable shopping bags than people in rural areas who are still used to using plastic bags as part of their daily activities. These differences show that behavior change requires an adaptation process that is influenced by social, economic, cultural, and environmental literacy factors.

The implementation of supervision is the main challenge in policy implementation. The vast administrative area of Bali Province causes local governments to face limited human resources to continuously monitor all business actors. Supervision is carried out more through periodic inspections of modern shopping centers and socialization activities than administrative

enforcement mechanisms. This condition causes the level of compliance between regions to still show quite high variation.

The perspective of policy implementation developed by Van Meter and Van Horn explains that the success of implementation is influenced by communication, resources, characteristics of the implementing organization, the disposition of the implementer, environmental conditions, and interorganizational relationships. The findings of the study show that policy communication carried out by the Bali Provincial Government has taken place intensively through socialization, mass media, social media, and coordination with the district/city government. This aspect of communication has succeeded in increasing the understanding of business actors on the substance of the policy. The availability of resources for supervision is still an obstacle so that the effectiveness of implementation is not fully optimal.

The characteristics of the implementing organization show a strong commitment from the Bali Provincial Government in integrating plastic waste reduction policies with source-based waste management policies as stipulated in Bali Governor Regulation Number 47 of 2019. The integration of the two regulations results in a more comprehensive policy approach because it not only focuses on limiting the use of plastics, but also encourages the reduction of waste generation from the source through sorting, reuse, and recycling.

The most prominent dimension in the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 is the involvement of customary villages as social institutions that have high legitimacy in Balinese society. The results of the study show that a number of indigenous villages have integrated the ban on the use of single-use plastics into *awig-awig* and *pararem*. This approach increases community compliance because customary norms have more effective social power than administrative law enforcement alone. The integration of formal institutions with customary institutions shows the characteristics of policy governance that are distinctive in Bali.

The findings of the study show that the successful implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 is not only influenced by the quality of regulations, but also determined by the government's capacity to build collaboration with various actors. The involvement of the private sector, communities, environmental organizations, academics, the media, and indigenous villages forms a complementary policy network in supporting the

achievement of plastic waste reduction goals. This condition indicates that the implementation of environmental policies can no longer be explained through conventional bureaucratic approaches, but requires a Collaborative Governance perspective that places collaboration as the main factor in the success of public policy implementation.

Starting Conditions as the Foundation of Policy Collaboration

The implementation of Bali Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 cannot be separated from the starting conditions that form the need for collaboration between actors. Ansell and Gash (2008) explain that the success of Collaborative Governance is influenced by the initial conditions which include resource imbalances, the history of relationships between stakeholders, the level of trust, conflicts of interest, as well as incentives that encourage actors to be involved in the collaborative process. These initial conditions determine the direction of inter-agency interaction and become the basis for the formation of a joint commitment to solving public problems. This perspective shows that the implementation of environmental policy cannot be understood only as an administrative process, but as a social process that involves the negotiation of interests, the distribution of authority, and the formation of trust among various actors.

The initial conditions of the implementation of the plastic waste restriction policy in Bali Province were influenced by increasing pressure on environmental quality as a consequence of the growth of the tourism sector. The development of the number of domestic and foreign tourists encourages an increase in the consumption of products made from single-use plastics in hotels, restaurants, shopping centers, modern markets, and daily community activities. These economic activities result in the generation of plastic waste that is getting bigger, causing pressure on regional waste management capacity. The characteristics of plastic waste that are difficult to decompose increase the risk of pollution of rivers, coastal areas, and the sea which are the main assets of Bali's tourism development. This condition is the main driving factor for the birth of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 as an instrument to control the use of single-use plastics.

The problem of plastic waste is not only influenced by the high volume of consumption, but also by the limited capacity of the government to manage waste independently. Conventional

waste management systems oriented towards transport and disposal to final processing sites are no longer able to keep up with the increase in waste generation each year. Limited capacity of the final processing site, increasing transportation operational costs, and low levels of waste separation from sources cause the effectiveness of waste management to experience various obstacles. These conditions show that local governments need the support of the private sector, communities, environmental organizations, academics, and indigenous villages to strengthen policy implementation.

Resource asymmetry is one of the characteristics of the initial condition that affects the collaboration process. The Bali Provincial Government has the authority to prepare regulations, provide budgets, and coordinate across sectors. Business actors have the financial and technological capacity to replace the use of single-use plastics with more environmentally friendly products. Civil society organizations have the ability to conduct public education and environmental advocacy. Universities have the capacity to produce scientific research and policy innovation. Customary villages have strong social legitimacy in building community compliance with environmental norms. The difference in capacity shows that each actor has complementary resources so that collaboration is a strategic need in policy implementation.

The relationship between stakeholders before the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 shows the experience of cooperation in various environmental management programs. The Bali Provincial Government has involved environmental organizations, waste care communities, academics, and district/city governments in the implementation of the Bali Green Province program, source-based waste reduction, and beach cleanliness movements. The collaboration experience is a social capital that facilitates the process of implementing policies to limit single-use plastics. Ansell and Gash (2008) explain that a positive history of cooperation will increase the chances of successful collaboration because actors have experience building communication, coordination, and trust.

Trust building is the main prerequisite in collaborative governance. The results of the study show that the level of trust between local governments and business actors is relatively high in the tourism sector because the implementation of policies is understood as an effort to maintain the image of Bali as a world-class tourist destination. Hotels, restaurants, and shopping

malls realize that environmental quality is a factor that determines the sustainability of the tourism business. This awareness encourages most business actors to support the implementation of Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 through the provision of environmentally friendly shopping bags, the elimination of plastic straws, and the use of reusable packaging.

The level of trust has not been fully formed in micro business groups and traditional traders. Some business actors view the plastic restriction policy as an additional burden because the price of environmentally friendly packaging is still relatively more expensive than conventional plastic. This perception causes some business actors to not fully support the implementation of the policy. This condition shows that the process of building trust requires intensive communication, incentives, and continuous mentoring so that behavior change can take place gradually.

Incentives for participation are an important factor that encourages the involvement of actors in policy implementation. The government benefits in the form of reduced pressure on the waste management system and improved environmental quality. Business actors benefit in the form of improving corporate image (green branding), increasing tourist confidence, and efficient use of resources through the concept of circular economy. The community benefits in the form of a cleaner and healthier environment. Traditional villages have the opportunity to strengthen cultural values that respect the balance between humans and nature as contained in the Tri Hita Karana philosophy. These common interests are the basis for the formation of a joint commitment in policy implementation.

The socio-cultural characteristics of the Balinese people made a significant contribution to the formation of the initial conditions of collaboration. The value of mutual cooperation, the concept of equalizing braya, and the philosophy of Tri Hita Karana have become social capital that strengthens community participation in various environmental programs. The harmonious relationship between humans and nature (palemahan) is a cultural value that is in line with the goal of the policy to limit plastic waste. The integration of cultural values strengthens the social legitimacy of the policy so that the implementation is not only based on compliance with regulations, but also on the moral awareness of the community to preserve the environment.

The existence of customary villages strengthens the characteristics of starting conditions in policy implementation. Customary villages have the authority to arrange *awig-awig* and *pararem* that regulate community behavior, including environmental management. A number of customary villages have included provisions regarding restrictions on the use of single-use plastics in traditional activities, religious ceremonies, and community social activities. This mechanism results in more effective social supervision than formal bureaucratic approaches because community compliance is built through cultural values and social sanctions that have been collectively accepted.

Analysis of the starting conditions dimension shows that the implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 has relatively strong initial capital compared to various environmental policies in other regions. Political support from local governments, common interests in maintaining tourism sustainability, the existence of customary institutions, and high public concern for the environment are factors that strengthen the collaboration process. Obstacles are still found in the form of inequality in the capacity of inter-sectors, limited access for micro businesses to alternative packaging, and variations in the level of public awareness. These barriers do not reduce the importance of the initial conditions as the foundation for the formation of collaborative governance, but show the need for capacity-building strategies, economic incentives, and improved policy communication so that collaboration can take place in a sustainable manner.

The findings of the study strengthen the argument of Ansell and Gash (2008) that the success of Collaborative Governance does not start from the formation of a collaborative forum, but from the initial conditions that are able to create incentives for all actors to work together. The context of Bali Province shows that the pressure on tourism sustainability, the high public concern for the environment, and the strength of local institutions have formed the foundation of collaboration which is an important factor in the successful implementation of Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018.

D. CONCLUSION

This study shows that the implementation of Bali Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste has made a positive contribution to efforts to reduce the use of single-use plastics and strengthen environmental governance in Bali Province. Policy implementation encourages behavior change in government agencies, the tourism sector, shopping centers, and some communities through reducing the use of plastic bags, plastic straws, and polystyrene (styrofoam). The strengthening of implementation through the Bali Governor's Circular Letter Number 2 of 2025 shows the commitment of the Bali Provincial Government to increase the compliance of government organizations while building a more environmentally friendly work culture.

Evaluation of policy implementation based on the perspective of Collaborative Governance shows that the success of policies is not only determined by the quality of regulations, but also influenced by the government's ability to build collaboration with various stakeholders. Local governments play the role of regulators as well as facilitators who connect the interests of the private sector, customary villages, civil society organizations, academics, media, and the community in achieving the goal of reducing plastic waste. This collaborative relationship has resulted in increased community participation, the growth of innovation in the use of environmentally friendly products, and the formation of a joint commitment to maintain environmental quality as a support for sustainable tourism development in Bali.

Analysis of the dimensions of starting conditions, institutional design, facilitative leadership, collaborative process, shared motivation, and capacity for joint action shows that Bali Province has strong collaboration capital in the form of political support from local governments, the existence of traditional villages as local institutions, Tri Hita Karana cultural values, and common interests in maintaining the sustainability of the tourism sector. Social capital is a factor that strengthens cross-sector coordination and increases the legitimacy of policy implementation at the community level.

Obstacles to implementation are still found in the form of inequality in capacity between sectors, limited supervision resources, uneven compliance of micro and informal sector actors,

high prices of single-use plastic substitute products, and non-optimal collaborative monitoring and evaluation systems. These conditions show that the successful implementation of policies requires strengthening cross-agency coordination, increasing institutional capacity, providing incentives for business actors who implement environmentally friendly practices, and developing an evaluation system that involves all stakeholders.

The novelty of this research lies in the development of the evaluation of the implementation of single-use plastic waste policies through the perspective of Collaborative Governance which integrates the roles of the government, the private sector, society, academics, environmental organizations, and local institutions in one analytical framework. The findings of the study show that the existence of customary villages not only functions as socio-cultural institutions, but also becomes a strategic actor in strengthening community compliance, building community-based supervision, and increasing the effectiveness of environmental policy implementation. The collaboration model enriches the development of public policy implementation theory in the context of local institution-based environmental governance.

The theoretical implications of the research confirm that the Collaborative Governance approach is able to provide a more comprehensive explanation than the policy implementation approach that is oriented towards purely bureaucratic aspects. The implementation of environmental policies requires adaptive, participatory, and collaborative governance in order to be able to deal with the complexity of environmental issues involving many actors with different interests. The practical implications of the research show the need to strengthen multi-stakeholder collaboration forums, increase the capacity of local governments in monitoring and evaluation, develop economic incentives for business actors, and optimize the role of indigenous villages in supporting the implementation of single-use plastic waste restriction policies. Strengthening these aspects is expected to increase policy effectiveness while supporting the realization of sustainable environmental governance in Bali Province.

REFERENCES

- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- Central Bureau of Statistics of the Province of Bali. (2024). *Bali Province in 2024*. Central Bureau of Statistics of the Province of Bali.
- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Stone, M. M. (2015). Designing and implementing cross-sector collaborations: Needed and challenging. *Public Administration Review*, 75(5), 647–663. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12432>
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.
- Dunn, W. N. (2018). *Public policy analysis: An integrated approach* (6th ed.). Routledge.
- Emerson, K., & Nabatchi, T. (2015). *Collaborative governance regimes*. Georgetown University Press.
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 22(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>
- George, C. E. (1980). *Implementing public policy*. Congressional Quarterly Press.
- Ministry of Environment and Forestry of the Republic of Indonesia. (2024). *National Waste Management Information System (SIPSN): Achievements of Indonesia's waste management performance in 2023*. Directorate General of Waste, Waste, and Hazardous and Toxic Materials Management.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Sage Publications.
- Ostrom, E. (2010). Beyond markets and states: Polycentric governance of complex economic systems. *American Economic Review*, 100(3), 641–672. <https://doi.org/10.1257/aer.100.3.641>
- Bali Provincial Regulation Number 5 of 2011 concerning Waste Management.
- Bali Governor Regulation Number 47 of 2019 concerning Source-Based Waste Management.

- Bali Governor Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste.
- Pierre, J., & Peters, B. G. (2021). *Governance, politics and the state* (2nd ed.). Red Globe Press.
- Sugiyono. (2023). *Qualitative research methods*. Alfabet.
- Bali Governor's Circular Letter Number 2 of 2025 concerning the Implementation of Bali Governor's Regulation Number 97 of 2018 concerning Restrictions on the Generation of Single-Use Plastic Waste.
- United Nations. (2015). *Transforming our world: The 2030 agenda for sustainable development*. United Nations.
- United Nations Environment Programme. (2023). *Turning off the tap: How the world can end plastic pollution and create a circular economy*. United Nations Environment Programme.
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18 of 2008 concerning Waste Management.
- Van Meter, D. S., & Van Horn, C. E. (1975). The policy implementation process: A conceptual framework. *Administration & Society*, 6(4), 445–488.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/009539977500600404>
- World Bank. (2021). *Market study for Indonesia: Plastic circularity opportunities and barriers*. World Bank.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). Sage Publications.